



The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Expert Elicitation Techniques for Social Scientists

John Paul Gosling (j.p.gosling@leeds.ac.uk)
Jose Pina-Sánchez (j.pinasanchez@leeds.ac.uk)

6th and 7th of December 2018

The MATCH Website

The MATCH Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

- The MATCH uncertainty elicitation tool
 - John
- Wh

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

- The coalition government tried to introduce a 50% reduction in convictions following an early guilty plea (currently the maximum is 33%)
- Hoping this would save money by reducing the number of cases going through court and from shorter custodial sentences

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

- The coalition government tried to introduce a 50% reduction in convictions following an early guilty plea (currently the maximum is 33%)
- Hoping this would save money by reducing the number of cases going through court and from shorter custodial sentences
- This was scrapped due to backlash in public opinion (considered too lenient)
- Beyond that, the policy did not seem ‘well thought through’

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

- The coalition government tried to introduce a 50% reduction in convictions following an early guilty plea (currently the maximum is 33%)
- Hoping this would save money by reducing the number of cases going through court and from shorter custodial sentences
- This was scrapped due to backlash in public opinion (considered too lenient)
- Beyond that, the policy did not seem ‘well thought through’
- There is some evidence pointing at innocent defendants pleading guilty as a less risky strategy than going to trial
 - Pretty terrible for *justice*
 - But also might end up consuming more resources

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

- It is not easy to produce robust evidence on this topic
 - Not easy to know whether the defendant was truly innocent
 - In the US 18% of known exonerees pleaded guilty to crimes they didn't commit (#GuiltyPleaProblem)
 - Not easy to work out the counterfactual

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

- It is not easy to produce robust evidence on this topic
 - Not easy to know whether the defendant was truly innocent
 - In the US 18% of known exonerees pleaded guilty to crimes they didn't commit (#GuiltyPleaProblem)
 - Not easy to work out the counterfactual
- It might take too long
 - Might need to wait for a natural experiment (e.g. a change in guilty plea legislation)

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

- It is not easy to produce robust evidence on this topic
 - Not easy to know whether the defendant was truly innocent
 - In the US 18% of known exonerees pleaded guilty to crimes they didn't commit (#GuiltyPleaProblem)
 - Not easy to work out the counterfactual
- It might take too long
 - Might need to wait for a natural experiment (e.g. a change in guilty plea legislation)
- In the absence of any evidence EKE could be used to inform policy
 - it might be worthwhile eliciting this knowledge from defence lawyers

Exercise 1: Guilty Plea Discounts

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

- Your task is to estimate the economic impact of increasing guilty plea reductions up to 50% in England and Wales
 - To do so first estimate the proportion of innocent defendants that would plead guilty under a 50% reduction scheme
- For the estimation of the economic cost consider the following
 - About 65,000 people were sent to prison in England and Wales in 2017
 - The most frequent custodial sentence length is roughly four years
- Start by estimating the proportion of innocent defendants that would plead guilty under a 50% reduction scheme

Exercise 2: Number of Rough Sleepers

- In 2017 six people died in Leeds due to rough sleeping
- To design an adequate policy response we need to know the number of rough sleepers living in Leeds
- According to statistics from the Ministry of Housing there were 28 rough sleepers in Leeds in 2017
- Some Councils conduct a count of the number of people seen sleeping rough on a single night, but most of them just provide an estimate based on intelligence from local services
 - Police were called to the city centre almost 200 times in two months to calls involving homeless people
 - The number of cases of reported Spice misuse increase from 16 per month in September 2017 to 66 per month in July 2018
 - Around 90 'aggressive and passive aggressive begging' incidents are recorded by the council each month
 - Paramedics were called to Boar Lane, City Square and Wellington Street 163 times in the last three months of 2017 to deal with issues relating to homelessness, drugs and alcohol

Exercise 2: Number of Rough Sleepers

- We could rely on the expert knowledge from homeless charities operating in Leeds
 - Volunteers from ‘St George Crypt’ or ‘Simon on the Streets’ patrol the streets of Leeds offering shelter and basic goods to rough sleepers
 - They know many of them by name
- Estimate the number of rough sleepers in Leeds city centre over Christmas using expert knowledge from local volunteers
 - Christmas is defined as the period from the 23rd of December 2018 to the 2nd of January 2019
 - City Centre to be defined as LS1 postcodes
 - To give some context, about 800,000 people live in the whole of Leeds and 100,000 commute into Leeds from elsewhere on an average weekday

Exercise 3: LGBT in Malaysia

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

- The Malaysian government recently estimated there are 310,000 LGBT people living in Malaysia
- Estimation undertaken by the Mukhayyam programme
 - A State sponsored program seeking to ‘rehabilitate’ those in the LGBT community
 - *“1,450 people had received assistance via this programme with some going on to get married, while some had changed their dressing and some are controlling themselves from returning to that lifestyle”* (Mohd Izwan, 2018)
- The method used to come up with the above figure has not been disclosed

Exercise 3: LGBT in Malaysia

The MATCH
Tool

Exercise 1

Exercise 2

Exercise 3

- Estimate the number of adults living in Malaysia in 2017 who experience feelings of attraction to others from their same gender
- Consider the following
 - A population of 31.62 million people
 - Polls carried out in different countries indicate that roughly 10% of the population reports attraction to others from their same gender